

CDA Extemporaneous Debate Judging Directions & Scoring Dimensions

- Ballot
- Instructions:
1. Before the round begins, fill in the information above as well as school and speaker names.
 2. During the round, use the flow chart to document the debate. Keep time!
 3. After the debate has concluded, use the rubric and your notes to determine the winning side. Score each debater in each dimension Fill in the scores (no lower than 20), and provide written comments for each speaker which mix praise and suggestions for improvement.
 4. Rank speakers first through fourth place. No ties!
 5. The winning team must have a higher total of speaker points. No ties or low-point wins!
 6. Individual speakers may have tie scores, but their ranks must differ.
 7. Write the name of the winning school, circle the winning side & sign the ballot.

- **The fundamental task of each team is to persuade the judge of the correctness and/or desirability of its position for (Affirmative) or against (Negative) the resolution.**
- **The decision should be based on the arguments presented by each team during the debate, and not on the knowledge, preference or reasoning of the judge.**
- *** Before assigning any score below 18 points, please consult officials in the tab room.**
- **The side that performs best as determined by these dimensions is the winner:**

Case: Is the debaters' case including contentions, definitions and overviews supported with logical reasoning, facts and analysis of materials derived from the packet and general knowledge?

Organization: Does the debater present their arguments in an orderly, logical way that can be followed?

Clash: Does the debater refute attacks on their own case with sound reasoning? Do they clash effectively with their opponent's positions?

Cross-examination: Does the questioner draw out useful information? Does he or she use these answers in subsequent speeches? Does the defending speaker's answers effectively defend their case?

Presentation: Does the debater deliver their speeches articulately, make eye contact with the judge, and otherwise speak well?

Civility: Is the debater polite and respectful? Debaters may be emphatic but not rude.

Structure of the Round:

Speech	Duration
1 st Affirmative Constructive	6 minutes
Cross-examination*	3 minutes
1 st Negative Constructive	6 minutes
Cross-examination*	3 minutes
2 nd Affirmative Constructive	6 minutes
Cross-examination*	3 minutes
2 nd Negative Constructive	6 minutes
Cross-examination*	3 minutes
1 st Affirmative Rebuttal	4 minutes
1 st Negative Rebuttal	4 minutes
2 nd Negative Rebuttal	4 minutes
2 nd Affirmative Rebuttal	4 minutes
Affirmative Prep Time**	6 minutes
Negative Prep Time**	6 minutes
Total	64 minutes

* Cross Ex is be "open"—both debaters may ask questions, but only the most recent speaker may answer questions.

** Prep time may be taken by a team only prior to one of its own speeches. Prep time is taken in one-minute blocks.

Sequence of Events in a Round of Debate

In Extemporaneous Debate, the statement to be debated (Resolution) and resource material packet is given to the debaters approximately one hour prior to the first round. Students will debate in alternating rounds both the Affirmative case (supporting the Resolution) and Negative case (opposing the Resolution).

Constructive Phase: Lines of reasoning must be presented during the Constructive phase of the debate.

- **1st Affirmative Constructive Speech (6 minutes):** The speaker has the prerogative to define terms contained in the Resolution. Definitions must be reasonable in content and scope. The speaker presents his or her team's Contentions (numbered statements of argumentation) in a clear manner. There are usually three contentions for each case, but there is no required number. The speaker should develop the reasoning which supports each of the team's contentions.
- **Cross Examination of 1st Affirmative Speaker (3 minutes):** The speaker may now be questioned by the opposing team. The speaker may not receive any help from his or her partner. Students may be emphatic during cross-ex, but not rude. **Questioners:** May ask for restatement of contentions and definitions. They may also ask questions intended to elicit responses which they can use against their opponents. For this information to be useful, however, it needs to be included in a subsequent speech. Within reason, questioners may interrupt a speaker stating "Thank you, you have answered my question" or the like. It may be important for them to do so to prevent the speakers from pitching their own case. **Speakers:** Are expected to answer reasonable questions to the best of their ability. They may ask for repetition or clarification or may respond that they do not know an answer. They may decline to answer inappropriate questions.
- **1st Negative Constructive Speech (6 minutes):** The speaker presents his or her team's Contentions in a clear manner and develops the reasoning which supports each of the team's Contentions. In addition, this speaker should begin to oppose the other team's Contentions and supporting arguments (clash). Further, this speaker has the prerogative to define any terms contained in the Resolution that the 1st Affirmative speaker did not define. This speaker may contest any definitions presented by the 1st Affirmative speaker if he or she believes them to be unreasonable.
- **Cross Examination of 1st Negative Speaker (3 minutes)** Same as above.
- **2nd Affirmative Constructive (6 minutes):** The speaker has two jobs: present clear opposing arguments and reasoning against the Negative team's case and further support and defend his or her own case.
- **Cross Examination of 2nd Affirmative Speaker (3 minutes)** Same as above.
- **2nd Negative Constructive (6 minutes):** The speaker has two jobs: present clear opposing arguments and reasoning against the Affirmative team's case and further support and defend his or her own case.
- **Cross Examination of 2nd Negative Speaker (3 minutes)** Same as above.

Rebuttal Phase. The order of the speeches changes so that the affirmative team has the last word in the debate. No new lines of argument may be presented during rebuttals; speakers may, however, support arguments and lines of reasoning already presented. They may do so with new examples or illustrations as long as the underlying argument is not new

- **1st Affirmative Rebuttal (4 minutes):** The speaker has three jobs: reaffirm their team's contentions, respond to arguments against those contentions by the opposing team, and press their attack on the opposing team's contentions.
- **1st Negative Rebuttal (4 minutes):** The speaker has three jobs: reaffirm their team's contentions, respond to arguments against those contentions by the opposing team, and press their attack on the opposing team's contentions.
- **2nd Negative Rebuttal (4 minutes):** The speaker has four jobs: reaffirm their team's contentions, respond to arguments against those contentions by the opposing team, and press their attack on the opposing team's contentions. The speaker should also summarize their own case.

NOTE: Some Negative teams may choose to speak in their consecutive speeches as a "Negative Block" so that one speaker addresses only the opposing team's arguments and the other speaker focuses only on their own case. As the allotted speaking time is so brief, this can be an effective strategy.

- **2nd Affirmative Rebuttal (4 minutes):** The speaker has four jobs: reaffirm their team's contentions, respond to arguments against those contentions by the opposing team, and press their attack on the opposing team's contentions. The speaker should also summarize their own case.

Prep Time: Each team has 6 minutes of prep time. They may call for prep time only prior to one of their own speeches and only in multiples of whole minutes.

Judging Procedures & Tips

Before the Round:

Preparation: First, be sure that you have a stopwatch, ballot & flowchart. These are all available in the TAB room. Fill out the information indicated on the ballot form (See directions at top of ballot.).

During the Round:

Taking Notes: Take careful notes on the flowchart document. Effective note-taking is one of your most important tools in judging the rounds. Use one column per speech. Write down each team's contentions. You can follow the clash of arguments through the debate and note when contentions are dropped by the opposing team or abandoned.

Timekeeping: The judge is responsible for timekeeping. Judges need to provide silent hand signals for the speeches, forewarning students that their time is running short: two fingers for two minutes left, one finger for one minute left, one hand forming a "C" for 30 seconds left. Announce when time is up. The speaker may finish his or her sentence. Hand signals are not needed for cross examination or prep time periods. The judge may simply announce in a clear but firm voice that time is out. Cross ex must cease immediately, even in the midst of oration. With prep time, additional minutes may be called for by debaters provided that they have prep time remaining.

After the Round:

Non Disclosure: After the final speech, ask the students to vacate the room so that you can mark the ballot in privacy. Results are strictly confidential and must not be disclosed until the trophies are awarded at the end of the tournament. Do not give copies of your personal notes, ballot or flowcharts to the debaters.

Ballot and Rubric Form: Using your flowchart notes, first decide which side won. Ties are not permitted. This is the key decision—ranks and scores follow from it. Then, following the directions on the ballot and rubric form, fill out both sides. PLEASE WRITE LEGIBLY. Rank the speakers from 1st through 4th place. *Speaker ranks may not be tied!* Use the rubric to rate the speakers' performances. Total each speaker's points. Point totals must reflect the ranks appropriately. Individual speaker point totals may be tied, but the winning team must have the highest speaker point team total.—NO TIES.

Ballot Return: Turn in your ballot/rubric to the TAB room immediately after filling out, BEFORE you go to the next round

Promptness: Please remember that we are trying to keep the tournament on schedule. Late return of ballots slows down the tournament and causes everyone to leave late.

Questions and Concerns:

Questions and concerns should always be brought to the attention of the Executive Director, Assistant Director, or their designated representative, who can usually be found in the TAB room.

Tips for Effective Judging:

- Your personal opinions on the resolution being debated must not enter into your decision.
- Judge the debate on what is presented by the debaters
- Debaters can't be expected to know what you know, so don't hold them to that standard.
- Unless one or more of the debaters are unacceptably rude or behave inappropriately, don't interrupt the debate.
- Student's attire is not to be considered when judging the round.

Ten Steps to Good Judging

1. Make sure you're in the right room at the right time.
2. Fill out the ballot correctly before the debate begins
 - School names, yours and theirs
 - Team codes
 - Names, yours and theirs
 - Room, round and level
3. Keep time and keep order during the debate
 - Attached sheet gives the timing for speeches, cross examination and prep time
 - Remember the hand signals: 2 minutes, 1 minute, 30 seconds
 - Don't interrupt unless you absolutely have to
 - Don't be afraid to nudge the debaters along between speeches
 - Ask if they are ready to begin
 - Offer prep time if they don't seem ready to speak
 - Stop taking notes when the time runs out
 - Let the speaker finish the sentence before calling time
4. Take notes!
 - The recommended approach is “landscape” mode, one column per speech
 - You can follow the clash of arguments through the debate
 - Without notes, by the end most people can't remember what was said at the beginning.
5. When the debate ends, have a useful, balanced word for the debaters
 - Don't give away the decision
6. ***DECIDE WHO WON!***
 - Ask the teams to leave and close the door before you start.
 - This is the key decision—ranks and scores follow from it, not the reverse.
 - ***Give your reason for the decision on the ballot!***
7. Rank order the speakers from 1 to 4
 - The ordering should match the decision, the winning teams ranks totaling 5 or less
 - ***Speakers cannot be tied in rank!***
8. Assign points based on where the speakers stand relative to their level (varsity or novice)
 - No lower than 20, no higher than 30
 - Points should agree with the rank ordering
 - Avoid ties if possible
 - A tie in speaker points goes to the Negative
9. Provide a brief written critique of each speaker on the ballot
 - Try to find something to praise and something that needs improvement
 - Feedback is extremely important to the debaters
 - ***Judges comments are the only feedback most debaters will ever receive!***
10. Get you ballot back to the tab room on time!
 - ***Do not leave the tab room before someone has checked your ballot!***
 - The next round can't start until all the ballots are in!